

Appendix H.1

**Criteria for Evaluating Potential for Built
Heritage Resources and Cultural Heritage
Landscapes Screening Checklist and
Supplemental Screening Documentation**

Criteria for Evaluating Potential for Built Heritage Resources and Cultural Heritage Landscapes

A Checklist for the Non-Specialist

The **purpose of the checklist** is to determine:

- if a property(ies) or project area:
 - is a recognized heritage property
 - may be of cultural heritage value
- it includes all areas that may be impacted by project activities, including – but not limited to:
 - the main project area
 - temporary storage
 - staging and working areas
 - temporary roads and detours

Processes covered under this checklist, such as:

- *Planning Act*
- *Environmental Assessment Act*
- *Aggregates Resources Act*
- *Ontario Heritage Act* – Standards and Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties

Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER)

If you are not sure how to answer one or more of the questions on the checklist, you may want to hire a qualified person(s) (see page 5 for definitions) to undertake a cultural heritage evaluation report (CHER).

The CHER will help you:

- identify, evaluate and protect cultural heritage resources on your property or project area
- reduce potential delays and risks to a project

Other checklists

Please use a separate checklist for your project, if:

- you are seeking a Renewable Energy Approval under Ontario Regulation 359/09 – [separate checklist](#)
- your Parent Class EA document has an approved screening criteria (as referenced in Question 1)

Please refer to the Instructions pages for more detailed information and when completing this form.

Project or Property Name

Sault Ste. Marie City Landfill

Project or Property Location (upper and lower or single tier municipality)

402 Fifth Line E, Sault Ste. Marie, ON P6A 6J8

Proponent Name

AECOM Canada Ltd.

Proponent Contact Information

Rick Talvitie, rick.talvitie@aecom.com, 705-942-2612

Screening Questions

- | | Yes | No |
|--|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Is there a pre-approved screening checklist, methodology or process in place? | ☒ | ☐ |

If Yes, please follow the pre-approved screening checklist, methodology or process.

If No, continue to Question 2.

Part A: Screening for known (or recognized) Cultural Heritage Value

- | | Yes | No |
|--|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 2. Has the property (or project area) been evaluated before and found not to be of cultural heritage value? | ☐ | ☒ |

If Yes, do **not** complete the rest of the checklist.

The proponent, property owner and/or approval authority will:

- summarize the previous evaluation and
- add this checklist to the project file, with the appropriate documents that demonstrate a cultural heritage evaluation was undertaken

The summary and appropriate documentation may be:

- submitted as part of a report requirement
- maintained by the property owner, proponent or approval authority

If No, continue to Question 3.

- | | Yes | No |
|---|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 3. Is the property (or project area): | | |
| a. identified, designated or otherwise protected under the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> as being of cultural heritage value? | ☐ | ☒ |
| b. a National Historic Site (or part of)? | ☐ | ☒ |
| c. designated under the <i>Heritage Railway Stations Protection Act</i> ? | ☐ | ☒ |
| d. designated under the <i>Heritage Lighthouse Protection Act</i> ? | ☐ | ☒ |
| e. identified as a Federal Heritage Building by the Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office (FHBRO)? | ☐ | ☒ |
| f. located within a United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) World Heritage Site? | ☐ | ☒ |

If Yes to any of the above questions, you need to hire a qualified person(s) to undertake:

- a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report, if a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value has not previously been prepared or the statement needs to be updated

If a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value has been prepared previously and if alterations or development are proposed, you need to hire a qualified person(s) to undertake:

- a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) – the report will assess and avoid, eliminate or mitigate impacts

If No, continue to Question 4.

Part B: Screening for Potential Cultural Heritage Value

	Yes	No
4. Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that:		
a. is the subject of a municipal, provincial or federal commemorative or interpretive plaque?	☐	☒
b. has or is adjacent to a known burial site and/or cemetery?	☐	☒
c. is in a Canadian Heritage River watershed?	☐	☒
d. contains buildings or structures that are 40 or more years old?	☒ See comments in supplemental information	☐

Part C: Other Considerations

	Yes	No
5. Is there local or Aboriginal knowledge or accessible documentation suggesting that the property (or project area):		
a. is considered a landmark in the local community or contains any structures or sites that are important in defining the character of the area?	☐	☒
b. has a special association with a community, person or historical event?	☐	☒
c. contains or is part of a cultural heritage landscape?	☐	☒

If Yes to one or more of the above questions (Part B and C), there is potential for cultural heritage resources on the property or within the project area.

You need to hire a qualified person(s) to undertake:

- a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER)

If the property is determined to be of cultural heritage value and alterations or development is proposed, you need to hire a qualified person(s) to undertake:

- a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) – the report will assess and avoid, eliminate or mitigate impacts

If No to all of the above questions, there is low potential for built heritage or cultural heritage landscape on the property.

The proponent, property owner and/or approval authority will:

- summarize the conclusion
- add this checklist with the appropriate documentation to the project file

The summary and appropriate documentation may be:

- submitted as part of a report requirement e.g. under the *Environmental Assessment Act*, *Planning Act* processes
- maintained by the property owner, proponent or approval authority

Instructions

Please have the following available, when requesting information related to the screening questions below:

- a clear map showing the location and boundary of the property or project area
 - large scale and small scale showing nearby township names for context purposes
- the municipal addresses of all properties within the project area
- the lot(s), concession(s), and parcel number(s) of all properties within a project area

For more information, see the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport's [Ontario Heritage Toolkit](#) or [Standards and Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties](#).

In this context, the following definitions apply:

- **qualified person(s)** means individuals – professional engineers, architects, archaeologists, etc. – having relevant, recent experience in the conservation of cultural heritage resources.
- **proponent** means a person, agency, group or organization that carries out or proposes to carry out an undertaking or is the owner or person having charge, management or control of an undertaking.

1. Is there a pre-approved screening checklist, methodology or process in place?

An existing checklist, methodology or process may already be in place for identifying potential cultural heritage resources, including:

- one endorsed by a municipality
- an environmental assessment process e.g. screening checklist for municipal bridges
- one that is approved by the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport (MTCS) under the Ontario government's [Standards & Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties](#) [s.B.2.]

Part A: Screening for known (or recognized) Cultural Heritage Value

2. Has the property (or project area) been evaluated before and found not to be of cultural heritage value?

Respond 'yes' to this question, if all of the following are true:

A property can be considered not to be of cultural heritage value if:

- a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) - or equivalent - has been prepared for the property with the advice of a qualified person and it has been determined not to be of cultural heritage value and/or
- the municipal heritage committee has evaluated the property for its cultural heritage value or interest and determined that the property is not of cultural heritage value or interest

A property may need to be re-evaluated, if:

- there is evidence that its heritage attributes may have changed
- new information is available
- the existing Statement of Cultural Heritage Value does not provide the information necessary to manage the property
- the evaluation took place after 2005 and did not use the criteria in Regulations 9/06 and 10/06

Note: Ontario government ministries and public bodies [prescribed under Regulation 157/10] may continue to use their existing evaluation processes, until the evaluation process required under section B.2 of the Standards & Guidelines for Conservation of Provincial Heritage Properties has been developed and approved by MTCS.

To determine if your property or project area has been evaluated, contact:

- the approval authority
- the proponent
- the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport

3a. Is the property (or project area) identified, designated or otherwise protected under the *Ontario Heritage Act* as being of cultural heritage value e.g.:

- i. designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
 - individual designation (Part IV)
 - part of a heritage conservation district (Part V)

Individual Designation – Part IV

A property that is designated:

- by a municipal by-law as being of cultural heritage value or interest [s.29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*]
- by order of the Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport as being of cultural heritage value or interest of provincial significance [s.34.5]. **Note:** To date, no properties have been designated by the Minister.

Heritage Conservation District – Part V

A property or project area that is located within an area designated by a municipal by-law as a heritage conservation district [s. 41 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*].

For more information on Parts IV and V, contact:

- municipal clerk
- [Ontario Heritage Trust](#)
- local land registry office (for a title search)

ii. subject of an agreement, covenant or easement entered into under Parts II or IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

An agreement, covenant or easement is usually between the owner of a property and a conservation body or level of government. It is usually registered on title.

The primary purpose of the agreement is to:

- preserve, conserve, and maintain a cultural heritage resource
- prevent its destruction, demolition or loss

For more information, contact:

- [Ontario Heritage Trust](#) - for an agreement, covenant or easement [clause 10 (1) (c) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*]
- municipal clerk – for a property that is the subject of an easement or a covenant [s.37 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*]
- local land registry office (for a title search)

iii. listed on a register of heritage properties maintained by the municipality

Municipal registers are the official lists - or record - of cultural heritage properties identified as being important to the community.

Registers include:

- all properties that are designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Part IV or V)
- properties that have not been formally designated, but have been identified as having cultural heritage value or interest to the community

For more information, contact:

- municipal clerk
- municipal heritage planning staff
- municipal heritage committee

iv. subject to a notice of:

- intention to designate (under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*)
- a Heritage Conservation District study area bylaw (under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*)

A property that is subject to a **notice of intention to designate** as a property of cultural heritage value or interest and the notice is in accordance with:

- section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*
- section 34.6 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. **Note:** To date, the only applicable property is Meldrum Bay Inn, Manitoulin Island. [s.34.6]

An area designated by a municipal by-law made under section 40.1 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as a **heritage conservation district study area**.

For more information, contact:

- municipal clerk – for a property that is the subject of notice of intention [s. 29 and s. 40.1]
- [Ontario Heritage Trust](#)

- v. included in the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport's list of provincial heritage properties

Provincial heritage properties are properties the Government of Ontario owns or controls that have cultural heritage value or interest.

The Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport (MTCS) maintains a list of all provincial heritage properties based on information provided by ministries and prescribed public bodies. As they are identified, MTCS adds properties to the list of provincial heritage properties.

For more information, contact the MTCS Registrar at registrar@ontario.ca.

3b. Is the property (or project area) a National Historic Site (or part of)?

National Historic Sites are properties or districts of national historic significance that are designated by the Federal Minister of the Environment, under the *Canada National Parks Act*, based on the advice of the Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada.

For more information, see the [National Historic Sites website](#).

3c. Is the property (or project area) designated under the *Heritage Railway Stations Protection Act*?

The *Heritage Railway Stations Protection Act* protects heritage railway stations that are owned by a railway company under federal jurisdiction. Designated railway stations that pass from federal ownership may continue to have cultural heritage value.

For more information, see the [Directory of Designated Heritage Railway Stations](#).

3d. Is the property (or project area) designated under the *Heritage Lighthouse Protection Act*?

The *Heritage Lighthouse Protection Act* helps preserve historically significant Canadian lighthouses. The Act sets up a public nomination process and includes heritage building conservation standards for lighthouses which are officially designated.

For more information, see the [Heritage Lighthouses of Canada](#) website.

3e. Is the property (or project area) identified as a Federal Heritage Building by the Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office?

The role of the Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office (FHBRO) is to help the federal government protect the heritage buildings it owns. The policy applies to all federal government departments that administer real property, but not to federal Crown Corporations.

For more information, contact the [Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office](#).

See a [directory of all federal heritage designations](#).

3f. Is the property (or project area) located within a United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) World Heritage Site?

A UNESCO World Heritage Site is a place listed by UNESCO as having outstanding universal value to humanity under the Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage. In order to retain the status of a World Heritage Site, each site must maintain its character defining features.

Currently, the Rideau Canal is the only World Heritage Site in Ontario.

For more information, see Parks Canada – [World Heritage Site website](#).

Part B: Screening for potential Cultural Heritage Value

4a. Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that has a municipal, provincial or federal commemorative or interpretive plaque?

Heritage resources are often recognized with formal plaques or markers.

Plaques are prepared by:

- municipalities
- provincial ministries or agencies
- federal ministries or agencies
- local non-government or non-profit organizations

For more information, contact:

- [municipal heritage committees](#) or local heritage organizations – for information on the location of plaques in their community
- Ontario Historical Society's [Heritage directory](#) – for a list of historical societies and heritage organizations
- Ontario Heritage Trust – for a [list of plaques](#) commemorating Ontario's history
- Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada – for a [list of plaques](#) commemorating Canada's history

4b. Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that has or is adjacent to a known burial site and/or cemetery?

For more information on known cemeteries and/or burial sites, see:

- Cemeteries Regulations, Ontario Ministry of Consumer Services – for a [database of registered cemeteries](#)
- Ontario Genealogical Society (OGS) – to [locate records of Ontario cemeteries](#), both currently and no longer in existence; cairns, family plots and burial registers
- Canadian County Atlas Digital Project – to [locate early cemeteries](#)

In this context, adjacent means contiguous or as otherwise defined in a municipal official plan.

4c. Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that is in a Canadian Heritage River watershed?

The Canadian Heritage River System is a national river conservation program that promotes, protects and enhances the best examples of Canada's river heritage.

Canadian Heritage Rivers must have, and maintain, outstanding natural, cultural and/or recreational values, and a high level of public support.

For more information, contact the [Canadian Heritage River System](#).

If you have questions regarding the boundaries of a watershed, please contact:

- your conservation authority
- municipal staff

4d. Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that contains buildings or structures that are 40 or more years old?

A 40 year 'rule of thumb' is typically used to indicate the potential of a site to be of cultural heritage value. The approximate age of buildings and/or structures may be estimated based on:

- history of the development of the area
- fire insurance maps
- architectural style
- building methods

Property owners may have information on the age of any buildings or structures on their property. The municipality, local land registry office or library may also have background information on the property.

Note: 40+ year old buildings or structure do not necessarily hold cultural heritage value or interest; their age simply indicates a higher potential.

A building or structure can include:

- residential structure
- farm building or outbuilding
- industrial, commercial, or institutional building
- remnant or ruin
- engineering work such as a bridge, canal, dams, etc.

For more information on researching the age of buildings or properties, see the Ontario Heritage Tool Kit Guide [Heritage Property Evaluation](#).

Part C: Other Considerations

5a. Is there local or Aboriginal knowledge or accessible documentation suggesting that the property (or project area) is considered a landmark in the local community or contains any structures or sites that are important to defining the character of the area?

Local or Aboriginal knowledge may reveal that the project location is situated on a parcel of land that has potential landmarks or defining structures and sites, for instance:

- buildings or landscape features accessible to the public or readily noticeable and widely known
- complexes of buildings
- monuments
- ruins

5b. Is there local or Aboriginal knowledge or accessible documentation suggesting that the property (or project area) has a special association with a community, person or historical event?

Local or Aboriginal knowledge may reveal that the project location is situated on a parcel of land that has a special association with a community, person or event of historic interest, for instance:

- Aboriginal sacred site
- traditional-use area
- battlefield
- birthplace of an individual of importance to the community

5c. Is there local or Aboriginal knowledge or accessible documentation suggesting that the property (or project area) contains or is part of a cultural heritage landscape?

Landscapes (which may include a combination of archaeological resources, built heritage resources and landscape elements) may be of cultural heritage value or interest to a community.

For example, an Aboriginal trail, historic road or rail corridor may have been established as a key transportation or trade route and may have been important to the early settlement of an area. Parks, designed gardens or unique landforms such as waterfalls, rock faces, caverns, or mounds are areas that may have connections to a particular event, group or belief.

For more information on Questions 5.a., 5.b. and 5.c., contact:

- Elders in Aboriginal Communities or community researchers who may have information on potential cultural heritage resources. Please note that Aboriginal traditional knowledge may be considered sensitive.
- [municipal heritage committees](#) or local heritage organizations
- Ontario Historical Society's "[Heritage Directory](#)" - for a list of historical societies and heritage organizations in the province

An internet search may find helpful resources, including:

- historical maps
- historical walking tours
- municipal heritage management plans
- cultural heritage landscape studies
- municipal cultural plans

Information specific to trails may be obtained through [Ontario Trails](#).

City of Sault Ste. Marie Landfill - 021_0500e Supplement

Screening Criteria	Results
PART A	
The background research and communications with heritage organisations did not locate any information which would suggest the property is associated with a historical event, persons, or community.	No previous CHR or CHL work has been undertaken on the property to date.
<i>Is the property (or project area):</i>	
Identified, designated or otherwise protected under the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> as being of cultural heritage value?	No, the Sault Ste. Marie Landfill is not designated or protected under the OHA. (Courtney Kovacich, personal communication, March 10, 2025)
a National Historic Site (or part of)?	No. (Parks Canada, https://parks.canada.ca/lhn-nhs/recherche-search , accessed on May 2, 2025)
designated under the <i>Heritage Railways Stations Protection Act</i> ?	No. (Parks Canada, https://parks.canada.ca/culture/designation/gare-station , accessed on May 2, 2025)
designated under the <i>Heritage Lighthouse Protection Act</i> ?	No. (Parks Canada, https://parks.canada.ca/culture/designation/phare-lighthouse , accessed on May 2, 2025)
identified as a Federal Heritage Building by the Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office (FHBRO)?	No. (Parks Canada, https://parks.canada.ca/culture/designation/revue-review , accessed on May 2, 2025)
located within a United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) World Heritage Site?	No. (UNESCO, World Heritage Interactive Map, https://whc.unesco.org/en/interactive-map/ accessed on May 2, 2025)
PART B	
<i>Does the property (or project area) contain a parcel of land that:</i>	
Is the subject of a municipal, provincial or federal commemorative or interpretive plaque?	No. (Corporation of the City of Sault Ste. Marie, Heritage Properties, accessed on May 2, 2025; Ontario Heritage Trust (OHT), Provincial Plaque Program, accessed on May 2, 2025)

has or is adjacent to a known burial and/or cemetery	No. (CanadaGenWeb's Cemetery Project, https://cemetery.canadagenweb.org/map-project/ , accessed on May 2, 2025)
is in a Canadian Heritage River watershed?	No. (Canadian Heritage River System, https://chrs.ca/en/rivers , accessed on May 2, 2025)
contains buildings or structures that are 40 or more years old?	Yes, there are two (2) buildings on the Sault Ste. Marie Landfill property that are older than 40 years of age (see below table and reference photos).

City of Sault Ste. Marie Landfill Site On-Site Building Structures >40 Years of Age		
Building Name	Building Age	Photo No's
Administration Building	55	1, 2
Maintenance Garage	55	3, 4
Source: City of Sault Ste. Marie Asset Management Plan		



Photo No. 1 - Administration Building (Southwest)



Photo No. 2 - Administration Building (Northeast)



Photo No. 3 – Maintenance Garage (Southeast)



Photo No. 4 – Maintenance Garage (Northwest)

The above photographs show the Administration Building and Maintenance Garage. Although both structures are over 40 years old, their architectural style, unremarkable design, and intended function indicate the two structures have low potential to be built heritage resources (i.e., low potential cultural heritage value or interest). Based on this assessment, further technical cultural heritage studies (e.g., cultural heritage report, heritage impact assessment) are not recommended.

Historical map sources were also examined to determine if earlier structures were present on the property:

•National Topographic System Maps:

o1995. Map 42K/9 Sault Ste Marie. Scale 1:50 000. Canadian Centre for Mapping, Energy, Mines and Resources Canada.

o1996. Map 41K Sault Ste Marie, Ontario. Scale 1:250 000. Canadian Centre for Mapping, Natural Resources Canada.

•Surveys and Historical Maps:

o1859. Map 2216 C28 No. 5 Plan of Tarentorus; Townships No1 North and South, Range 25 West. Scale 40 Chains [804m] to 1 Inch. Albert P. Salter.

o1859. City of Sault Ste. Marie Townships No1 North and South, Tarentorus, Range 25 West. Scale 40 Chains [804m] to 1 Inch.

o1926. ARM35a Sault Ste Marie Area, District of Algoma, Ontario. Scale 1:126,720. Ontario Department of Mines.

o1985. Maps 1 to 3 of the Aggregate Resources Inventory of the Sault Ste. Marie Area, Algoma District. Scale 1:50 000. Ontario Ministry of Natural Resources.

PART C

Is there local or Aboriginal knowledge or accessible documentation suggesting that the property (or project area):

is considered a landmark in the local community or contains any structures or sites that are important in defining the character of the area?

Based on the information available, it does not seem the property of the landfill is considered to be a landmark, or contains any other structures 40 years of age or older. (William Hollingshead, personal communication, March 5, 2025; Virginia McLeod, personal communication, March 5, 2025)

has a special association with a community, person, or historical event?

The background research and communications with heritage organisations did not locate any information which would suggest the property is associated with a historical event, persons, or community. (William Hollingshead, personal communication, March 5, 2025; Virginia McLeod, personal communication, March 5, 2025)

contains or is part of a cultural heritage landscape?

Based on the information received to date, and an analysis of its setting in a historical context, it does not appear that the Sault Ste. Marie Landfill is associated with a cultural heritage landscape.

Evaluating Neighbourhoods and Areas in Sault Ste. Marie

Scoring

4 = Excellent 3 = Good 2= Fair 1= Poor

Criteria <i>Assessment Indicators</i>	Design Value		Cultural Value		Natural Value	
	Score	Have a rare, unique, representative, or early collection of a style, expression, material or construction method or architectural period?	Score	Have direct associations with a theme, event, person, activity, organization, institution, or religious or spiritual belief that is significant to a community?	Score	Have a rare, unique, or representative collection of significant natural resources?
<i>Does the area ...</i>	1		1		1	1
	1	Have a rare, unique, or representative layout, plan, landscape, or spatial organization?	1	Yield or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of the history of a community or area?	1	
	1	Display a consistently high degree of overall craftsmanship, artistic merit, architectural features, or vernacular style?	1	Demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of a planner, architect, landscape architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to a community?	1	
	1	Have minimal modifications (e.g., siding) conducted to properties, maintaining a cohesive character throughout the area?				
	0	Have a presence of one or more designated heritage properties?*				
	4	TOTAL SCORE If score is 11 or over, criteria have been fulfilled.	3	TOTAL SCORE If score is 8 or over, criteria have been fulfilled.	1	TOTAL SCORE If score is 4, criteria have been fulfilled.

If select area satisfies **2** of **3** criteria: Area can begin process of **locally significant heritage area** designation.

If select area fulfills **1** of **3** criteria: Area can begin process of designation as a **character neighbourhood**.

*Assign one point for each heritage property to a maximum of 4. An area may receive a score of 0 for this parameter.